



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Linda Williams (Chair), Dawn Hill-Holdgate (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, David Barham, Diane Coombs
Associate Commissioners: Jascin Leonardo-Finger, Abigail Camp **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder

~~ MINUTES ~~

September 17, 2013 – NEW BUSINESS

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room –5:00 p.m.

Called to order at 5:00 p.m.

Staff in attendance: J. Grieder, HDC Assistant Administrator; T. Norton, Town Minutes Taker
Attending Members: Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp
Absent Members: None
Late Arrivals: Hill-Holdgate 5:05 p.m.; Coombs 5:39 p.m.
Early Departures: Hill-Holdgate 7:05 p.m.; McLaughlin 8:59 p.m.; Coombs 9:36 p.m.

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

None

III. 60-DAY DEADLINES

None

IV. NEW BUSINESS

1. Woodbury Lane RT	Lot 16B Barnabus Ln – HSAB Fence	41-571	Meerbergen
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Camp		
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger		
Recused	None		
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.		
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Presented project: fence along back side.		
Public	None		
Concerns	(5:05) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Recommend a view; unclear where this is going. Is there a house? Are there any photos? McLaughlin – No comments Barham – Stated he would prefer the fence no more than 30 to 36 inches high. Camp – No comments. Williams – Agrees with		
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff 36” natural to weather board fence. (Barham)		
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60212

Minutes for September 17, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

2. Dolceamore, Tony		80 Washington Street – HSAB A/C Units	42.2.3-201	Riley, James
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	James Riley – Going on the back where the fence is.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:10) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Need more info: where's it going, very unclear. Barham – Concerned about visibility from the beach; a 3' board gate would screen the view of the tanks and air-conditioning (A/C). Need to know the flood elevation, how high the A/C will be sitting, the size of the unit and drawings to show what is happening with the piping and a sketch of the proposed gate.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
3. Abramson, Leigh		3 Charter Street – HSAB	Window/door change	42.3.2- 120 Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Camp			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:18) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Would like to see existing historic window reused, and date of ell for proposed work. Barham – There are no drawings of the previous approval or existing conditions and the changes aren't clouded. It might be an as-built application.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for corrected drawings. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
4. Halberstam, Jean		12 Coffin Street – HSAB	Addition	42.3.2-44 Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:23) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Recommend a view. Hill-Holdgate – It is in keeping with the house. Leonardo-Finger – Clarification about which side of the house is visible from the street and the location of the front door. McLaughlin - North elevation, the "A" windows are too large. Barham – There is no north arrow on the maps. East elevation, the far right new "B" window is in the wrong place. The ganged "A" windows are too tall and too large for the link, north elevation especially; visibility is right through the links.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions to the fenestration. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

Minutes for September 17, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

IV. OLD BUSINESS / VIEWS

1. Miner, Lauren	12 S. Valley Road	Cottage	43-139	JMS Arch
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Sarah Alger , Sarah F. Alger P.C. - Submitted revised drawings at the table; reviewed those revisions.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:32) Staff – Read previous concerns from August 6. Barham – The eave detail over the garage doors is heavy unless there is a gutter mounted there; the roof needs to be extended 4 inches and brackets built out. Dormers on west elevation and south elevation should be narrowed; they are too wide; would be in favor of a shed dormer on the south elevation. E elevation should be raised so eave runs across. Camp – Agrees with Mr. Barham. McLaughlin – No comments. Williams – Agrees with Mr. Barham.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
2. Lampe, John	197 Cliff Road	Color Change	30-170.1	Lampe
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:39) Staff – Read application specifications. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60213	
3. Lynch, Michael	58A Orange Street – HSAB	Move/demo	55.4.1-792	SMRD
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Joe Topham , S.M. Roethke Design – Presented project. Has anecdotal evidence that this structure was built in 1961. Original structure was a pump house and demolished in 1960. Michael Lynch			
Public	None			
Concerns	(5:41) Staff – Read applications specifications. HSAB – Historic info is needed; believe it is at least early 20 th century. Hill-Holdgate – Has problems with moving or demolishing the 1960 structure. A house could be designed that follows the feel of a garage. McLaughlin – Wants to see what's going in its place. Coombs – The existing might not be historic but it is part of the Orange Street landscape. Barham – Town Counsel has told us we are not a preservation organization and have jurisdiction only over appearances; this structure is an example of that in that what was built in the 1961 looked was true to the historic use in this location. Concerned about letting it go because it preserves the historic look. Williams – This is a 1961 structure; and if its replacement is approvable, can do that. Discussion about whether or not that ruling applies here.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information on the original structure. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

Minutes for September 17, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

4.	Lynch, Michael	58A Orange Street– HSAB	New dwelling	55.4.1-792	SMRD
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Joe Topham , S.M. Roethke Design – Presented project.				
Public	Michael Lynch				
Concerns	<p>(5:50) Staff – Read application specifications. Read an abutters letter into the record.</p> <p>Hill-Holdgate – There is a valid point of designing something that looks in keeping with the historic use. A Greek revival is not the way to go; it should be a similar style: a garage/barn type of structure.</p> <p>McLaughlin – South elevation, casement window should be either hopper or fixed. The gables should be shingled. A similar situation occurred on York Street.</p> <p>Coombs – Would rather see something smaller and similar in design. The garage is part of the streetscape and has been there over 40 years. Should not have 2-over-2 windows. South elevation, windows should not be ganged; dormers are too large, the shingled deck doesn't fit. Dormers should be shed dormers.</p> <p>Barham – Agree that what goes here should bear an historical relationship to what was there: it was an anomaly to the street. Not in agreement with the move/demo. The 2-over-2 windows, patterned shingle work, 1st-floor ganged windows, and diamond windows are all inappropriate to this design. This looks like a building inappropriately modified to fit a later period.</p> <p>Williams – We are taking a dart and throwing it at a 1960s structure. The existing structure is not designed like the original which was gable to the street. The proposed is gable to the street. No problem with the existing going away and a Greek revival going in its place.</p> <p>Discussion about what design structure should go on the lot once it is cleared. Consensus: 4 for a design that reflect what was there.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
5.	Kilmartin	11 New Mill Street – HSAB	Demo garage	55.4.4-87	Thornewill Dsgn.
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project. Will research the date further.				
Public	None				
Concerns	<p>(6:07) Staff – Read application specifications.</p> <p>HSAB – Need a date and have concerns, more historical information is needed.</p> <p>Williams – The locus map is unclear as to the location of the structure.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Garage was constructed in 1961.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Barham)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		60214

Minutes for September 17, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

6.	Kilmartin, John	11 New Mill Street – HSAB	Addition	55.4.4-87	Thornewill Dsgn.
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(6:10) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Need date of the ell. Second-story portion is large and not appropriate additive massing. McLaughlin – The existing north elevation living room was put on when the garage was built in the 1960s. The casement windows are inappropriate; they should be hoppers or fixed. Coombs – Agrees with the HSAB comments. Barham – Agrees with HSAB. The new rear addition side walls should follow the walls of the original house; there should be a break on the west elevation; dormers need to be significantly smaller. West elevation ganged windows are not appropriate on this house. The original house is small enough that a full 2 nd floor on the back would overwhelm the original structure. Hill-Holdgate – The addition has a perfectly symmetrical bump coming out of the east and west sides; should not happen on the east elevation. Williams – Agrees with what’s been said.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
7.	Kilmartin, John	11 New Mill Street – HSAB	Garage/studio	55.4.4-87	Thornewill Dsgn.
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(6:21) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Too close to the road, very tall. Barham – Agree it is too tall; entire roof structure should drop 18 inches. Agree about moving it away from the road. Dormer facing the street should have three windows or be narrowed for the two windows. There is only 8 feet between the structures which crowd the lot; suggested moving the house addition to the opposite side away from the garage. Hill-Holdgate – This garage is not in keeping with the original house, competes with it and is too tall. Doors seem overly tall. There should be no front dormer. McLaughlin – South elevation casement window should be a hopper. Coombs – Agree with Ms Hill-Holdgate.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		

Minutes for September 17, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

8. FAO NT	29 Orange Street – HSAB	Additions, renovations	42.3.2-69	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:28) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Front porch on left, need the age; the fenestration in the 1920s image is not appropriate for the age of this house. The east elevation double-ganged windows are not appropriate. Addition impact on original house and visibility. South elevation same as the east. Age of chimney; historic chimney should not be removed. Hill-Holdgate – Agree with HSAB about the east elevation fenestration. North elevation transom is not appropriate and same on the west. No concerns about the sun room. Barham – North elevation, okay with addition but agree about the transoms; placement of the window in that corner is problem. East elevation ganged windows should remain as exists. South elevation, not enthused about going back to the 1920s look; not in favor of rearranging the rest of the windows to the left of the sun porch; the 1-story hipped roof does not work well. West elevation no transoms. Would prefer to see the chimney stay. Coombs – Agree with what’s been said. Would be okay with going back to the 4 windows on the porch. McLaughlin – North elevation rear, the 3-over-6 windows should be changed. Transoms are visible. Williams – Agree no transoms and no windows in corners. Not enthused about the east elevation changing to doubles top and bottom. Hipped on the south elevation doesn’t work. Rear elevation transoms don’t help. Believe the singles proposed on the front and back are appropriate. Okay with removal of the chimney.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
9. Upland Corp.	20 Straight Wharf – HSAB	Rev. COA 60005: fenestration	42.3.1-86	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Presented project. There is a structural reason for going with smaller windows.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:42) Staff – read application specifications. HSAB – East elevation should echo window pattern above. No concerns west elevation. Williams – When this came before the board before, we said no changes to the windows. Barham – The windows front and back should relate to each other; don’t find them objectionable. Not enthusiastic about the other change; the west elevation window in the dormer facing the street being reduced in size. There is an enormous dormer and the rationale for a dormer ought to be a window. Coombs – No concerns. McLaughlin – It’s approvable.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the “E” windows above be moved down and no change on the west elevation. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60215

Minutes for September 17, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

10. Glenhurst West RT	137 Cliff Road	New dwelling	30-259	CWA
Sitting	Williams, Hill-Holdgate, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Chip Webster , Chip Webster Architecture – Presented project. Steven Cohen , Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, Gifford & Cohen LLP – Previous architect refused to make changes and quit.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(6:48) Staff – Read application specifications. Hill-Holdgate – There is some visibility from the water and Gosnold Road. The 2-over-2 windows are not appropriate. Roof walk is too large and should not be skirted. The perfectly symmetrical large chimneys are atypical. Should not be white. Would like to see a 3D perspective. Shed dormers are a huge improvement. East elevation “E” windows are too large. North elevation doors are too large; the deck integrated into the porch roof is appropriate; the one on the right is not. Barham – Agree about seeing a 3D view. There are massing issues; okay with a house of this scale on this lot. The 2-over-2 windows don’t work. The house does not lay claim to a style. Angling the wings on the forecourt doesn’t work. Would like to be able to see all four elevations in 1/8 th scale on one page and need a roof plan. Coombs – West elevation is visible from Tupancy, the whole elevation is ganged windows and that’s not appropriate. East elevation has too many ganged windows. Agree with what’s been said. McLaughlin – Wst elevation is the only thing harmonious. The rest is out of character with the Island: too much glass. Would like to see the grade contours. Williams – The owner is trying to maintain the foot print and likes the courtyard; but agree with much that’s been said. Lacks additive massing: no 1-story elements, no rambling. “B” windows are not appropriate. Oversized 4-light windows will be visible; and the 10-foot window is visible from the water. The plate height should be reduced.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and a topo map, 3D view, consolidated elevation on one sheet, photo from landscape showing this and abutter’s house in context. (Barham			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
(Break 7:05 to 7:14)				
11. Mario, Christopher	6 Delaney Road	Move off: garage	41-115	SCI/C. Lenhart
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Charles Lenhart , Sandcastle Construction Inc. – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:14) Staff – Read application specifications. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve demo/move. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60216
12. Mario, Christopher	6 Delaney Road	Move on-site: main house	41-115	SCI/C. Lenhart
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Charles Lenhart , Sandcastle Construction Inc. – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:16) Staff – Read application specifications. Barham – It is moving very close to the road. The right sidewall will be on a corner and is one that would be found mid-block; would be better moved to the left lot. Stated that this project was not included in his view pack and so he did not look at it. McLaughlin – No concerns. Coombs – No concerns. Camp – Agree about the side of the house being on Dartmouth Lane. Williams – No concerns. Discussion about locating it 3 feet back from the proposed location.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the structure located another 3 feet back from Delaney. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 4-1/Barham opposed		Certificate #	60217

Minutes for September 17, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

13. Mario, Christopher	6 Delaney Road	Hardscaping	41-115	SCI/C. Lenhart
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Charles Lenhart , Sandcastle Construction Inc. – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:25) Staff – Read application specifications. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60218	
14. Shuttleworth, Paul	112 Somerset Road	New dwelling	66-223	BPC
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	McLaughlin			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Doug Mills , BPC – Presented project. A deed restriction requires the garage to be attached. Paul Shuttleworth			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:28) Staff – Read application specifications. Barham – Okay that it isn't a cape style. There are additive massing issues. The northwest elevation 2 nd -floor deck on the front doesn't work and bears no relation to the porch posts below; the triple-gang window in gable to the left of the front door doesn't work. Vertical boarding is more appropriate for a barn-like structure. The additive massing off to the right, the wing under the chimney as seen from the southwest, the porch steps back only 20 inches and the roof over grass looks funny; it might help if the windows were smaller. The hips integrate into the roof oddly and need to be reshaped to something less complicated. The massing is very complicated for a house of this size and they aren't well proportioned. The structure is too long. Leonardo-Finger – Agree with what's been said. Southwest elevation dormers on the main mass are odd. Southeast elevation has too many "D" windows on the garage. Coombs – The "E" windows in the dormers are oddly shaped; panes should not be square. French doors should have a kick panel. Camp – Vertical lines on the front of the house are confusing. "E" and "D" windows should be 2-over-2 windows. Nothing to add. Williams – Agree with much that's been said. The 2-over-2 windows are not appropriate. The windows are oversized on everything except the main mass. The garage should be detached.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
15. Alfa Ocean NT	51 Ocean Avenue – SAB	Move off	73.3.2-53	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ray Pohl , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project: it would build the approved structure all new. This structure is circa 1993.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:43) Staff – Read applications specifications Leonardo-Finger – Wants it on the record that because it was built in 1993 and as it is being built to exactly reproduce what is existing, no concerns. No other commissioners have concerns. Barham – Would like detailed drawings of the fine work so that the new will exactly match the existing. The defining architectural features are there to be seen, need information in the file so that the fine work on the new one will precisely match.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with addition to the file of archival photos of the defining exterior architectural elements of the building to include porch details, window details and such other features that distinguish the existing structure and full-sized profiles of the porch columns, eave and brackets. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60219	

Minutes for September 17, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

16. Alfa Ocean NT	51 Ocean Avenue – SAB	New dwelling	73.3.2-53	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ray Pohl , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project: to build the approved structure all new. This structure is circa 1993.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:43) Staff – Read applications specifications Leonardo-Finger – Wants it on the record that because it was built in 1993 and as it is being built to exactly reproduce what is existing, no concerns. No other commissioner concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as previously approved. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60220	
17. Johnson	2 Hamblin Road	New dwelling	30-193	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Stated that it is difficult to give a presentation if commissioners are making comments. Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(7:51) Staff – Read application specifications. Barham – South elevation divides in character between the main mass and the left addition; they don't look like they belong together. The main mass as a cross gable has exaggerated the height; would be better as a straight 4-bay eave to the street. Two dormers on the right addition are crowded. The main mass is formal but with 6-over-1 windows; should be 6-over-6 with hooded top and shutters. Porch is too casual. Wing to the left of the south elevation should be taller. Roof walk in the present configuration is a non-starter especially due to the steep roof pitch. Gable dormers are okay but too heavy. Camp – Agree about the addition on the left. Like the design of the main massing and like the skirt. Coombs – Do not like the skirt on the roof walk; it is huge. Doghouse dormers on the south elevation don't fit in. Agree with much Mr. Barham said. McLaughlin – Agree with Mr. Barham; the 6-over-1 windows are inappropriate. A quarter of the windows are casements; that is too many. Williams – Don't like the massing at all. It is 80 feet across; way too large for Hamblin Road. Cross gable doesn't work if they want a roof walk. The 1 st floor plate height should be reduced. Rear elevation 2 nd floor deck is too long and not well integrated; need a profile drawing.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
18. Clark, Pam	1 Pleasant Street – HSAB	Remove chimney	42.3.3-112	J. Lydon
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Jim Lydon – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:05) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Not clear which chimney is being removed; need historic information on the chimney. Coombs – Not in favor of the removal of chimneys but this is just cosmetic. Barham – This is not on a corner and lacks visibility. Thinks this is approvable.			
Motion	Motion to Approve due to the fact it is not on the corner and lacks visibility. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60221	

Minutes for September 17, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

19. Kilvert, Emily	4 Darling Street – HSAB	Addition	42.3.2-19	Thornewill Dsgn.
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:10) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – Question visibility, recommend a view. Old windows should remain. Proposed transition is odd and is not historically appropriate. McLaughlin – No comments. Coombs – South elevation, the porch is too large; 2 nd -floor windows are too many in the set of three on the left. West elevation, window on the right in the foundation is too large (it's an egress window). Camp – South elevation, windows are asymmetric. Barham – Agree about the south elevation; the deck should be lower; too many windows of too many styles; doors under the window should remain; double eave over the kitchen bump out could be removed and the roof brought down. Agree with Ms Coombs about the deck. Williams – Would be happy to get rid of the two doors.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
20. FOG NT	17 Milestone Crossing	Shed	68-458	J. Hollis
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	James Hollis – Cedar V-groove doors natural to weather.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:20) Staff – Read application specifications. Williams – This is at the very end of Milestone Crossing on a lot with heavy trees. It is not visible. Barham – There is no information about the door.			
Motion	Motion to Approve due to minimal visibility. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried 3-1/Barham opposed; McLaughlin abstain	Certificate #	60222	
21. Holland, Christopher	29 Broadway – SAB	Material change: roof	73.1.3-46	Self
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation. Email from Town Counsel.			
Representing	(Chris's son) Holland			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:24) Williams – Had asked Town Counsel for advice on how HDC could issue an approval for Weatherwood architectural shingles on this structure. Motion to release to the public Town Counsel's opinion. (Coombs) Carried unanimously Discussion about Town Counsel's opinion. Leonardo-Finger – No comments. Barham – Don't see from his understanding that HDC has the jurisdiction to make a ruling based on the sub-straight. Williams – Adding plywood to the roof would change the profile of the roof and eave.			
Motion	Motion to Approve architectural Weatherwood shingles due to the reasons cited in the letter.			
Vote	Carried 2-0/Barham opposed; Leonardo-Finger abstain	Certificate #	60223	

Minutes for September 17, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

22. Kumin, Solomon	17 Head of Plains	Hardscaping: pool	63-56	Ahern
Sitting	McLaughlin, Barham (acting chair), Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Williams			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Miroslava Ahern – Reviewed changes per previous concerns. The wall is very low and has very little visibility.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:34) Staff – Read application specifications. No copy of the previous concerns. McLaughlin – No concerns. Camp – Had asked for different stone to soften the look. Should be softened with vegetation. Barham – Clarified that the outdoor kitchen will not be visible. There is no visibility of the retaining wall.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60224	
23. Jordan, Jennifer	41 Sheep Pond Road	Move on-site: dwelling	63-17.1	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Hurricane shutters have existed on the house in 2000 and the owner has used them frequently; she is hesitant to remove them. Sarah Alger , Sarah F. Alger P.C. – Explained the front-yard setback bordering all of Sheep Pond Road is due to a Zoning Board of Appeals ruling based upon the by-law. Objected to Mr. Barham’s motion; the building was approved in its current position and is appropriate in the new location; move is essentially on the same property. Stated the opinion that it is unfair to hold them hostage to design changes.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:39) Staff – Read application specifications. Barham – Would like to see the hurricane shutters removed since it is being moved to a new property.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the elimination of the hurricane shutters from the east and west elevations. (Barham) not carried. Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 3-1/Barham opposed	Certificate #	60225	
24. Clausson, Olof	30 Eel Point Road	Garage-studio	40-41.1	Thornewill Dsgn.
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Luke Thornewill , Thornewill Design – Presented project			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:45) Staff – Read application specifications. Barham – Have a problem with the way the stair comes onto the deck. McLaughlin – No comments. Camp – No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with railing and stairs natural to weather. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 3-1/Barham opposed	Certificate #	60226	

Minutes for September 17, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

25. Oak Hill Investment	40 Long Pond Road – MAB	Move on-site	59.4-115	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	Leonardo-Finger			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Plan to make modifications.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(8:49) Staff – Read application specifications. Barham – Not appropriate to the neighborhood: stovepipe in the roof, huge dormers, elevated deck. Williams – Need those plans. Could approve but not release pending the revisions.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
26. Quidnet Development	34 Quidnet Road	New dwelling	21-53	Roger Puglisi
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Andrew Falkenstein – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Roger Puglisi			
Public	Luke Thornewill – The only effort they ask for in keeping with the rural guidelines for old Quidnet, reduce the main mass 8 inches and have a mud block; that would lower the ridge.			
Concerns	(8:57) Barham – The trellis should not go down to the level of the deck; openings in the trellis should be reduced to 2 or 4 inches. Below the triple window and window well beneath needs to have the window described and grate should be wood natural to weather. North elevation is entirely bubbled with no previous rendition; that is satisfactory. Roof around the South elevation porch; plans suggest a pan roof or flat roof; deck needs to be pulled back toward the house. Leonardo-Finger – Have issues with the ganged windows on the 2 nd floor and agree with the abutter. Camp – Agree with Mr. Thornewill and would like his comments incorporated. Williams – Agree with Mr. Barham.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with corrected drawings per Exhibit A showing: no changes to north elevation; south elevation show basement windows and door, window wells to have wood grates, and changes to the trellis per comments. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 3-1/Leonardo-Finger opposed	Certificate #	60227	
27. Ten Bachus Lane Trust	10 Backus Lane	New dwelling	55-100.1	Chris Loftus
Sitting	Williams, Coombs, Leonardo-Finger, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Chris Loftus – Changing the windows would look weird.			
Public	David Barham – 2 nd story windows could easily be made to conform. The downstairs window: there is already a window in the staircase.			
Concerns	(9:17) Staff – Read previous concerns from September 3. Williams – The drawings are not ¼-inch scales. The horizontal panes are not approvable. Camp – The windows with horizontal panes should be changed. Coombs – The whole of the south and north elevations are using that window with the horizontal panes. Leonardo-Finger – Changed the kitchen windows to “E” windows. Williams – South elevation faces industrial Nantucket Ice and is not an issue. North elevation faces another house is not an issue. Orientation points are all wrong. Discussion among commissioners about what is visible and what is not and what needs to be changed and what is okay. Staff – Is concerned that an approval through staff is being rushed and would be too complicated and therefore not be done correctly; prefer the application to be held for revisions and to come back to the board.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the “C” windows changed to a smaller version of the “B” windows on the north and south elevations. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60228	

Minutes for September 17, 2013, adopted Oct. 3

Rest of the agenda carried over to Thursday September 19.

28. Traynor	13B Willard Street	Deck	68-509	SCI/Newman, Rob
29. Westfall	30 Monomoy Road	Rev. COA 58836	54-210	CWA
30. Avenue Dolphin LLC	6 Dolphin Court	Rev: new dwelling	42.4.1-113	Brook
31. Hall	135 Orange Street	Dismantle/demo	55-285	Hall
32. Houlihan/Morash	13 Hedgebury Ln	Dwelling	60.2.1-6	Val
33. Houlihan/Morash	13 Hedgebury Ln	Cabana	60.2.1-6	Val
34. Houlihan/Morash	13 Hedgebury Ln	Hardscaping: pool	60.2.1-6	Val
35. Werle, Wendy	8 Sankaty Road – SAB	Dormer	79-114	V. Oliver
36. 3.Ryder, Bert	11 Gray Avenue	Hardscaping: retaining wall	67-324	Val Oliver
37. Dickerson, Sarah	7 West Creek Road	Add two skylights	55-167	S. Paradis
38. Ribik, Joan	12 Chuck Hollow Road	Revisions	72-79	Val
39. Burns	24 Nonantum Avenue	New dwelling	87-157	Emeritus
40. 76 Main St LLC	76 Main Street – HSAB	H/C lift	42.3.1-11	Self
41. Vogel, Gary	22 Blackfish Lane	Cottage	73-133	Emeritus
42. Vogel, Gary	22 Blackfish Lane	Garage	73-133	Emeritus
43. Vogel, Gary	22 Blackfish Lane	Pool	73-133	Emeritus
44. 2-4 Chins Way LLC	2-4 Chins Way	Revisions	55-162	BPC
45. Levenson	32 Nonantum Avenue	Revisions: pool	87-22	BPC
46. Levenson	50 Nonantum Avenue	Revisions: pool	87-38.1	BPC
47. Steinberg, Diane	18 East Tristrams Avenue	Rev. COA 58080	31-33.1	Botticelli & Pohl
48. Oak Hill Investment	7 S. Valley Road	Revisions: dwelling	43-143	Emeritus
49. Oak Hill Investment	7 S. Valley Road	Tracking: pool	43-143	Emeritus
50. Oak Hill Investment	7 S. Valley Road	Tracking: garage/studio	43-143	Emeritus
51. Oak Hill Investment	7 S. Valley Road	Tracking: shed/cabana	43-143	Emeritus
52. Soren Sorenson	21 Woodbine Street	Cabana changes	80-321	Emeritus
53. 23 Commercial Whf NT	23 Commercial Whf – HSAB	Renovation/addition	42.2.4-5	Rowland Assoc.
54. Dunning	5 N. Liberty Street - HSAB	Move on-site; addition	42.3.4-7	Wesquo/Hollister
55. Cohan, William	81 Baxter Road – SAB	Move on-site; renovation	49-33	Cottage & Castle

V. OTHER BUSINESS

Approve Minutes	July 2 nd , August 20 th and 22 nd , September 3 rd and 5 th – no motion.
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 36 Union Street-petition for constructive grant response from Town Counsel – Need verification of when the appeal was submitted and whether or not it was done in time. • Next organization meeting – Need a date; staff suggested not to hold it on a Tuesday. • New fee schedule • Update on RLS (request for legal services) to Town Counsel – staff handed out the opinion on the flood zone. • Appeal 74 – 76 Centre Street Sept. 18, 2013, update – Appeal has been continued. Staff had a handout • Williams stated that there is no decision on 86 Main Street because Town Counsel has asked for the file and Mr. Voigt hasn't given it to him; stated that she and Mr. Grieder will be doing that on September 18 and giving it to Town Counsel. • Williams stated that Town Counsel has asked for the approval for 8 Milestone road and that also has not been transmitted to him; stated that she and Mr. Grieder will be doing that also on September 18. Town Counsel and the attorney for 8 Milestone are working together to come to a settlement. • Barham asked about a property at the northern end of Centre Street. Williams doing the RLS for 6 Gull Island; that was requested 2 weeks ago and has not been transmitted yet so is doing the RLS for that as well.
Commission Comments	None

Motion to Adjourn: 9:41 p.m.

Submitted by:
Terry L. Norton

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board

SAB – 'Sconset Advisory Board

TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board

MAB – Madaket Advisory Board